

New Hampshire
State Board of Education
Minutes of the September 9, 2015 Meeting

AGENDA ITEM I. CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the State Board of Education was convened at 9:10 a.m. at the Department of Education, 101 Pleasant Street, Concord, NH. Tom Raffio presided as Chairman.

Members present: Tom Raffio, Bill Duncan, Gary Groleau, Helen G. Honorow, Gregory Odell, and Emma Rous, were present. Cindy C. Chagnon was unable to be present. Virginia M. Barry, Commissioner of Education, and Paul K. Leather, Deputy Commissioner of Education, were also present.

AGENDA ITEM II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Gregory Odell led the pledge of allegiance.

Paul Leather introduced Douglas Earick who has joined the Department and will be working on curriculum frameworks for science.

AGENDA ITEM III. PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no Public Comment at this meeting.

AGENDA ITEM IV. OPEN BOARD DISCUSSION

Chairman Raffio said that the North Country Charter School Annual Report is data based and state of the art. Chairman Raffio said that one of the Business and Education Coalition goals they are working on is the "65x25" initiative that provides a target that offers a meaningful impact on the state's future and has the community college system behind it.

Gary Groleau mentioned the E2 Square (the Education Driven Economic Development) involving the community college system has had one meeting and will be meeting on Thursday. Mr. Groleau said that education drives the economy.

Gregory Odell mentioned that the White Mountain Regional High School has upgraded the school with a new sprinkler and alarm system.

Chairman Raffio reminded Board members that the October 19 State Board meeting is in Unity.

AGENDA ITEM V. SPECIAL PRESENTATIONS

A. Appointments to Professional Standards Board – Judy Fillion said that at the beginning of each school year the State Board appoints members to the Professional Standards Board. There are currently six vacancies to be filled.

Category I – Teachers and Education Specialists

Appoint Joanne Goelzer – first three-year term (2015-2018)
Science Teacher, Coe Brown Northwood Academy,
Northwood

Appoint Michele Mitnitsky – first three-year term (2015-2018)
Science Teacher, Dover High School, Dover

Category II – Higher Education and Education Administration

Re-appoint Peter Durso – second three-year term (2015-2018)
Richard Towle Elementary School, Newport

Appoint Cynthia Lucedro – first three-year term (2015-2018)
Professor of Education & Coordinator of Field Experience,
NHTI, Concord

Re-appoint Dianna Terrell – second three-year term (2015-2018)
Assistant Professor, St. Anselm College, Manchester

Appoint R. Page Tompkins – first three-year term (2015-2018)
Executive Director & Faculty, Upper Valley Educators
Institute, Lebanon

MOTION: Gary Groleau made the motion, seconded by Bill Duncan, that the State Board of Education approve the above appointments and re-appointments to the Professional Standards Board.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

B. NH Kids Count – Ellen Fineberg, Executive Director for NH Kids Count, said the Annie E. Casey Foundation just released its 2015 national data book and NH Kids Count released our state data book this spring. Ms. Fineberg distributed 2015 Kids Count Profile for New Hampshire, the 2015 Kids Count Data Book that explains state trends in child well-being, and the NH Kids Count Data Book for 2015. Ms. Fineberg reviewed the Profile with Board members. The Kids Count projects make the Data Book available to national, state and local leaders across the country. Ms. Fineberg said that many positive trends signal that the economy is finally recovering from the deep recession but there are warning signs that the recovery may be leaving the lowest-income families behind. We know from research that low family income can have negative

effects on children. When very young children experience poverty, particularly if that poverty is deep and persistent, they are at high risk of encountering difficulties later in life.

MOTION: Emma Rous made the motion, seconded by Helen Honorow, that the State Board of Education support the work of NH Kids Count.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

C. Commissioner's Non-Public School Approval Designation Report – Judy Fillion reported that a vote is needed to accept and approve the recommended designations for New Hampshire non-public schools with an approval status that expired June 30, 2015. Administrative Rule Ed 400 requires non-public schools to submit a request every five years to renew their program approval status and every three years to renew the attendance approval status. Approval of this Report allows the schools with expired approval status to continue to operate.

MOTION: Helen Honorow made the motion, seconded by Gary Groleau, that the State Board of Education accept and approve the Commissioner's Non-Public School Approval Designation Report.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

D. Professional Educator Preparation Program – Virginia Clifford reported on this item.

1. Hellenic American University – Hellenic American University is chartered in New Hampshire and all programmatic approvals stem from New Hampshire. The University was founded as an institution of higher learning with degree granting authority by an Act of the New Hampshire Legislature and the signature of the Governor of New Hampshire on May 11, 2004. Its degree programs are approved, regulated, and monitored by the Department of Education, Division of Higher Education, Higher Education Commission. The site visit for the proposed English as a Second Language (ESOL) certification program occurred on January 26-27, 2015. While the University does offer a myriad of programs at its Manchester campus, this is the first program seeking teacher licensure through the Department. The review was conducted to determine the proposed effectiveness of the institution's candidate and program

assessment systems. Based on the final report, the Council for Teacher Education made the following recommendation.

MOTION: Gary Groleau made the motion, seconded by Bill Duncan, that the State Board of Education grant six-month conditional approval through February 29, 2016 for the newly proposed English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) professional educator preparation program at Hellenic American University with the following items to be addressed:

Progress Report to address the following recommendations:

- Develop competency-based assessments to measure candidate knowledge.
- Review New Hampshire Teacher Candidate Assessment of Performance (NHTCAP) expectations for assessing teacher candidates in NH and articulate how these expectations will be incorporated into the program.
- Incorporate district, state, and federal requirements regarding English Language Learners with respect to special education.
- Incorporate state eligibility and reclassification requirements for English Language Learners.

Annual Report to address the following recommendations:

- Articulate how HAU will engage in the shift from traditional assessment to competency based performance assessment of their candidates.
- Develop a plan to allow teacher candidates the opportunity to demonstrate understanding of Assessing Comprehension and Communication in English State-to-State (ACCESS) testing that takes place in the spring of the academic year.
- Develop a clearly articulated assessment system of students meeting ESOL competencies during the practicum (e.g., a student developed portfolio).

When HAU satisfies the recommendations set forth by the review team, the ESOL program will be eligible for full three-year approval.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

E. Hearing – Student/Greenland School Board – SB-FY-15-10-004 –
The Parents, the Student, Patrick O'Day, Attorney for the Parents, Jeanne Kincaid, Attorney for the Greenland School Board, and Salvatore Petralia, Superintendent of Schools for SAU #50 which includes Greenland, were present. Chairman Raffio asked the parties if they would like the hearing held in public or nonpublic session. They elected to hold it in nonpublic session.

MOTION: Gregory Odell made the motion, seconded by Gary Groleau, to go into nonpublic session.

VOTE: This was done by a roll call vote: Emma Rous – Yes; Gary Groleau – Yes; Helen Honorow – Yes; Tom Raffio – Yes; Bill Duncan – Yes; Gregory Odell – Yes.

MOTION: Tom Raffio made the motion, seconded by Bill Duncan, to come out of nonpublic session.

VOTE: This was done by a roll call vote: Emma Rous – Yes; Gary Groleau – Yes; Helen Honorow – Yes; Tom Raffio – Yes; Bill Duncan – Yes; Gregory Odell – Yes.

MOTION: Tom Raffio made the motion, seconded by Bill Duncan, that the State Board of Education voted to adopt the following decision.

New Hampshire Board of Education

Student/Greenland School District

SB-FY-15-10-004

State Board Decision

I. Introduction

This matter is an appeal of a finding by the local school board that the student was not bullied under RSA 193-F.

II. Findings of Fact

1. On April 29, 2014, the parents filed a bullying complaint with the school district using a form provided by the school district.
2. The complaint alleged 23 incidents of bullying over a period of several years.
3. The incidents include allegations of name calling with such names as “goldilocks” because the student is a male with long blond hair, and allegations of a game called “X Touch” where other students would all try to avoid being touched by the student.
4. The parents alleged that there were over 20 students that participated in these incidents.

5. The name calling occurred over a period of years. It is unclear in the record exactly how long or how often the X¹ Touch game occurred, but it was not an isolated event, and the school board agreed that the name calling were a pattern of incidents.
6. The parents stated that these incidents caused the student to cry at night and ask his parents why all the students were picking on him.
7. The parents also stated that the incidents led to the student being anxious about attending school, wanting to hurt himself, and developing a very poor self-image.
8. The student began seeing a therapist and was placed on anti-depressant medication.
9. The parents contend that teachers were well aware of the incidents and that some would pull the student aside and tell him that they would protect him.
10. The school district has a bullying policy called Policy JICK.
11. Pursuant to its policy, the school conducted an investigation of the allegations in the complaint.
12. The investigation was conducted by the assistant superintendent of schools.
13. The investigation was very thorough and considered and addressed each of the 23 allegations.

¹ In an effort to protect the child's identity, all references to his name have been changed to "X."

14. The investigation determined that the allegations either were not substantiated or did not rise to the level of bullying.
15. For the incidents that did not rise to the level of bullying (which include the name calling based on hair and X Touch, incidents 1,10,14, 19,21, 23), the investigation determined that the incidents did occur, but did not rise to the level of bullying because 1) the incidents were based on the student's hair which is not an immutable characteristic, 2) the parents did not prove that there was causation between the emotional harm the student suffered and the incidents, and 3) there was not an imbalance of power.
16. The parents appealed the investigator's decision to the local school board.
17. The local school board conducted a hearing over 3 days where the school and parents presented evidence and questioned witnesses.
18. The school had two attorneys at the local school board proceeding. One presented evidence for the school and the other ran the proceedings for the school board and made recommendations and decisions about evidentiary issues.
19. In a split decision, the majority of the board affirmed the findings in the investigator's report.
20. The school board's decision notes that even though it found that bullying did not occur, the school was still willing to take certain steps to address the behaviors that were complained about including giving the student preferential seating in class and a special location for his locker.
21. The behaviors that the parents complained about, particularly the name calling and X Touch game appear to have stopped after the complaint was filed and the investigation took place.
22. The student will not be attending school in the school district next school year. He will attend a charter school.
23. The parents appeal the local school board's decision to the State Board of Education.
24. The parents seek a variety of remedies including an order from the state board requiring the local school district to establish a timeline to implement training, an order from the state board requiring the local school district to find that bullying occurred and send letters to the perpetrators stating that they are guilty of bullying the student, and reimbursement of medical and legal expenses.

25. The parties submitted a comprehensive record to the hearing officer. The record includes documents produced during the investigation and information from the local school board hearing.
26. The record establishes that the student did suffer emotional distress from the name calling and "X Touch" incidents. The distress included anxiety about going to school, crying at night, difficulty sleeping, and plummeting self-esteem. The student was placed on anti-depressant medication.
27. The name calling and "X Touch" incidents were motivated by an imbalance power. The record includes statements from witnesses noting that the perpetrators were engaged in a pack mentality in carrying out these actions.

III. Rulings of Law

1. RSA 193-F:3 states:

- I. (a) "Bullying" means a single significant incident or a pattern of incidents involving a written, verbal, or electronic communication, or a physical act or gesture, or any combination thereof, directed at another pupil which:
 - (1) Physically harms a pupil or damages the pupil's property;
 - (2) Causes emotional distress to a pupil;
 - (3) Interferes with a pupil's educational opportunities;
 - (4) Creates a hostile educational environment; or
 - (5) Substantially disrupts the orderly operation of the school.
- (b) "Bullying" shall include actions motivated by an imbalance of power based on a pupil's actual or perceived personal characteristics, behaviors, or beliefs, or motivated by the pupil's association with another person and based on the other person's characteristics, behaviors, or beliefs.

4. The incidents involving name calling and X Touch game rose to the level of bullying under RSA 193-F.

IV. Rulings

1. The local school district erred in finding that bullying did not occur.
3. Personal characteristics under the bullying statute, RSA 193-F, do not have to be immutable characteristics.
4. The Greenland School District shall submit an amended bullying report to the Department of Education.

5. The Student X's name shall be redacted from the Hearing Officer's Report in order to preserve his/her personal privacy.

6. The Greenland School District shall send a letter to the parents of all students attending the school where these incidents took place notifying them of the decision of the State Board of Education. This letter shall discuss bullying and sensitivity.

September 9, 2015

(Signed by Chairman)

Date

Tom Raffio
Chair, State Board of Education

VOTE: This was done by a roll call vote: Emma Rous – Yes; Gary Groleau – Yes; Helen Honorow – Yes; Tom Raffio – Yes; Bill Duncan – Yes; Gregory Odell – Yes.

MOTION: Gregory Odell made the motion, seconded by Emma Rous, to seal the Minutes of the nonpublic meeting for an indefinite period.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

F. Public Hearing – Initial Proposal – Ed 306.31 Arts Education Program, Ed 306.37 English/Language Arts, Ed 306.40 Health Education Program, Ed 306.41 Physical Education Program, Ed 306.42 Information and Communication Technologies Program, Ed 306.43 Mathematics Program, Ed 306.45 Science Education Program, Ed 306.46 Social Studies Program – These rules in Ed 306 provide for the minimum standards for public school approval in the above areas. The rules describe the requirements of credits from seat time to competencies, with respect to the college-and career-ready standards and the school approval process. This proposal readopts the standards that had been applied since March 7, 2014 and had been continued temporarily by emergency rule effective June 29, 2015 and permanently repeals the standards for public school approval that would have applied as of July 1, 2015 if legislative approval had been obtained before that date. The emergency rule effective June 29, 2015 had temporarily repealed these prospective standards because legislative approval had not been obtained. The emergency rule is scheduled to expire December 26, 2015 and the intent of the current proposal is simply to continue the effect of the emergency rule through regular rulemaking. Chairman Raffio opened the hearing at 11 am. There was no testimony. Chairman Raffio closed the hearing at 11:45 a.m.

G. Renewal of North Country Charter Academy – Commissioner Barry said that a vote is needed from the Board to authorize the charter renewal of North Country Charter Academy. The renewal term is for five years. The International Center for Leadership in Education and Scholastic Achievement Partners conducted an onsite needs assessment. The needs assessment report identified North Country Charter Academy strengths and provided recommendations on ways to increase student performance and make instruction more effective.

MOTION: Bill Duncan made the motion, seconded by Helen Honorow, that the State Board of Education authorizes the renewal of the North Country Charter Academy.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by 5 - 0 vote of the Board present, with Gregory Odell abstaining, and with the Chairman voting.

H. Oz Land Early Learning Center/NHDOE – SB-FY-15-08-001 – This item was withdrawn.

AGENDA ITEM VI. NEW DEPARTMENT BUSINESS

There was no New Department Business at this meeting.

AGENDA ITEM VII. LEGISLATIVE ISSUES

A. Initial Proposal – Ed 507.15 Health Educator and Ed 612.16 Health Education – A vote is needed by the Board to enter the rulemaking process to adopt the Initial Proposal for Ed 507.15 Health Educator and Ed 612.16 Health Education. The health educator and health education rules are being updated to reflect current standards and practices and being readopted with amendments because they will expire on July 1, 2016. If the Board adopts the Initial Proposal, the Department will enter the rulemaking process by filing it with the JLCAR, along with a request for fiscal impact statement. The Board will hold a public hearing at its November meeting. This information will be published in the rulemaking register next month.

MOTION: Gary Groleau made the motion, seconded by Bill Duncan, that the State Board of Education adopt the Initial Proposal for Ed 507.15 and Ed 612.16 Health Education and the Board will hold a public hearing on this rulemaking filing for November 18, 2015 at 11:00 a.m.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

B. Adopt – Ed 505.03(e), 506.05 Curriculum Administrator, and Ed 614.12 Curriculum Administrator – A vote is needed by the Board to adopt this Rule. The Department has made changes to the Final Proposal in response to the recommendations of JLCAR based on the conditional approval. Once adopted by the State Board of Education, the Office of Legislative Services will be notified and the rule will then go into effect.

MOTION: Bill Duncan made the motion, seconded by Gary Groleau, that the State Board of Education adopt the Final Proposal for Ed 505.03(e), Ed 506.05 Curriculum Administrator and Ed 614.13 Curriculum Administrator.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

C. Initial Proposal – Ed 505.07 Professional Education Requirements: Alternatives 3, 4, and 5 and 610.02 Professional Education Requirements – A vote is needed by the Board to enter the rulemaking process to adopt the Initial Proposal. The professional education requirements rule is being updated to reflect current standards and practices and being readopted with amendments. If the Board adopts the Initial Proposal, the Department will enter the rulemaking process by filing it with the JLCAR, along with a request for a fiscal impact statement. The Board will hold a public hearing at its November meeting. This information will be published in rulemaking next month.

MOTION: Helen Honorow made the motion, seconded by Bill Duncan, that the State Board of Education adopt the Initial Proposal for Ed 505.07 Professional Education Requirements: Alternatives 3, 4, and 5 and Ed 610.02 Professional Education Requirements and that the Board will hold a public hearing on this rulemaking filing for November 18, 2015 at 11:30 a.m.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

D. Final Proposal for Ed 1200 Limiting the Use of Child Restraint and Seclusion Practices – A vote is needed by the Board to adopt the Final Proposal for Ed 1200 Limiting the Use of Child Restraint and Seclusion Practices. The Department has made changes to the initial proposal in order to respond to comments from public testimony and the staff attorney who reviewed the rule for the JLCAR. It is necessary for the Board to act on this rule filing to meet the extended deadline of September 16, 2015 to file this final proposal pursuant to RSA 541-A or start a new rulemaking process.

MOTION: Emma Rous made the motion, seconded by Gregory Odell, that the State Board of Education adopt the Final Proposal for Ed 1200 Limiting the Use of Child Restraint and Seclusion Practices.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

E. Conditional Approval – Ed 507.16 and Ed 612.21 Physical Education, Ed 506.04 Principal and Ed 506.08 Assistant Principal – A vote is needed by the Board to adopt the conditional approval response for Ed 507.16 and Ed 612.21 Physical Education, Ed 506.04 Principal and Ed 506.08 Assistant Principal to comply with the conditional approval for rule filing 2015-61 approved by the JLCAR. The conditional approval is based on changes to the final proposal as recommended by the attorney for the Office of Legislative Services. If we make the following changes, the Office of Legislative Services can determine we have amended the rules in accordance with the conditional approval and issue a letter to that affect. The conditional approval includes using all lower case for department of education in Ed 507.16(b), adding introduction language to Ed 507.16(c) and removing the word “personal” from section Ed 507.16(2) a and Ed 612.21(b)(1). Once reviewed by the Office of Legislative Services to determine the rules have been amended in accordance with the conditional approval and RSA 541-A:13, V(a), the Board may then adopt the final rule.

MOTION: Gary Groleau made the motion, seconded by Bill Duncan, that the State Board of Education adopt the changes to the Final Proposal for Ed 507.16 and Ed 612.21 Physical Education, Ed 506.04 Principal and Ed 506.08 Assistant Principal to comply with the conditional approval for rule filing 2015-61.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

F. Various Items and Related Bills – Deputy Commissioner Leather said Department staff have been meeting with the Legislature throughout the summer regarding special education services, charter schools, adequacy aid and school building aid. He thinks there will be some legislation coming forward in the next session. There is a two week period for the House to submit new bills. Bill Duncan said there are two bills he is watching dealing with Suspension and Expulsion, as well as Student Resource Officers.

Mr. Leather said the PACE results should be out around the second week of November. There are four additional districts for next year: Concord, Monroe, Seacoast Charter School and Pittsfield.

Chairman Raffio mentioned that the Governor's STEM Task Force will be reviewing the science standards. Mr. Leather said that Eric Feldborg will become a member of the new Task Force. There will be changes in the members. Mr. Leather said that the Next General Science Curriculum Standards will be reviewed.

Helen Honorow asked that the Manchester School District update the Board at the October meeting on class size.

AGENDA ITEM VIII. COMMISSIONER'S REPORT

Commissioner Barry updated the Board on Smarter Balanced assessment. The time frame has been released to Superintendents. They are to submit a designee who will review the material. The information will be released to teachers around September 28th for the validation process. The information will be released to the media around November 8th. They are providing parents with a readable report. Communication Tool Kits will be sent to school districts. Results will be shared with the Board at the November meeting. The preliminary data has been released to school districts to review. Commissioner Barry said the 11th grade SAT assessment will be next year and during the school day. The Department will be sending the SAT data to administrators shortly. Commissioner Barry commended Heather Gage on her communication process on Smarter Balanced with the districts.

AGENDA ITEM IX. OLD BUSINESS

There was no Old Business at this meeting.

AGENDA ITEM X. CONSENT AGENDA

A. Minutes of July 15, 2015 Meeting

MOTION: Bill Duncan made the motion, seconded by Gregory Odell, to approve the Minutes of July 15, 2015.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

B. Minutes of Nonpublic Session July 15, 2015 Meeting

MOTION: Helen Honorow made the motion, seconded by Gary Groleau, to approve the Minutes of Nonpublic Session July 15, 2015 and to seal the Minutes for an indefinite period.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

C. Notes of July 24, 2015 Board Retreat

MOTION: Emma Rous made the motion, seconded by Bill Duncan, to approve the Notes of the State Board Retreat July 24, 2015.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

D. Notes of August 5, 2015 Meeting

MOTION: Bill Duncan made the motion, seconded by Gary Groleau, to approve the Notes of the August 5, 2015 Meeting.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

E. Tuition Contract Between Croydon School District and Newport School District – A vote is need by the Board to approve the Tuition Contract between the Croydon School District and the Newport School District. Croydon does not maintain a public middle or high school. The Newport School District does maintain a middle and high school that is approved by the Board and is willing to accept Croydon students on a tuition basis. Approval of this contract will permit fifth grade through twelfth grade students who reside in the Croydon School District to receive a public education in the Newport School District at Croydon's expense. It will also make Newport School District's high school the high school maintained by the Croydon School District, as set forth in RSA 194:22.

MOTION: Gary Groleau made the motion, seconded by Bill Duncan, that the State Board of Education approve the Tuition Contract between the Croydon School District and the Newport School District for a term of one year, commencing July 1, 2015 and ending June 30, 2016.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

F. Tuition Agreements Between Bath and Haverhill School Districts, Benton and Haverhill School Districts, Piermont and Haverhill School Districts, and Warren and Haverhill School Districts – A vote is needed by the Board to approve these contracts. The Bath School District, the Benton School District, the Piermont School District, and the Warren School District do not maintain a school and is desirous of having its students attend school in the Haverhill Cooperative School District and has authorized its school board to enter into tuition agreements. The Haverhill Cooperative School District maintains schools approved by the Board and is willing to receive certain students from outside the district and to afford them the complete course of instruction now given in its schools.

MOTION: Helen Honorow made the motion, seconded by Bill Duncan, that the State Board of Education approve the Tuition Agreements between the Bath, Benton, and Piermont School Districts with the Haverhill Cooperative School District for the 2015 school year; and that the Board approve the Tuition Agreement between the Warren School District and the Haverhill Cooperative School District from the 2015-2016 school year through school year 2020-2021 for a total of six years.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

AGENDA ITEM XI. TABLED ITEMS

There were no Tabled Items at this meeting.

AGENDA ITEM XII. NONPUBLIC SESSION

The Board went into Nonpublic Session under Special Presentations.

AGENDA ITEM XIII. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Bill Duncan made the motion, seconded by Helen Honorow, to adjourn the meeting at 11:50 a.m.

VOTE: The motion was adopted by unanimous vote of the Board present, with the Chairman voting.

Virginia M. Barry

Secretary